

	HERITAGE IMPACT STATEMENT
Name of Place:	<i>Norman House & Magnolia Tree, Cheyne's Stable & Outbuilding</i>
Date:	July 2023
Prepared by:	H + H Architects
Prepared for:	██████████

Revision #	Issue	Distribution
00	Pre DA Submission – April 2023	██████████
01	DA Submission	City of Albany

Heritage Listings:

Norman House & Magnolia Tree was first adopted as a Category B place on the City of Albany's Municipal Heritage Inventory in 2001 and was subsequently upgraded to a place of 'Considerable' significance on the City of Albany's Heritage List and Local Heritage Survey in 2020.

The place was also included on the Register of the National Estate in 1995 although this has no statutory implications as the Register was frozen in 2007 as part of changes to the *EPBC Act* in 2004.

It is understood that the place was previously considered for assessment for inclusion on the State Register of Heritage Places but did not warrant further assessment (deemed not to meet criteria for State heritage listing).

Cheyne's Stable & Outbuilding is co-located on the same site as *Norman House* and is included in the place record form for Norman House. This building is also commonly known as Cheyne's Cottage but this appears to be a misnomer for the Stable & Outbuilding. There is a significant Oak Tree associated with the place. This place was previously listed on the City of Albany Municipal Heritage Inventory as a Category A place.

Methodology

This heritage impact statement has been prepared on the basis of the place having significance at a 'local' level only, noting that the Dept of Planning, Lands & Heritage did not consider that the place warranted further assessment for the State Register of Heritage Places.

As the site includes places that are identified as having variable levels of heritage significance, the impacts on each element are assessed separately, considering the nature and degree of significance.

Where there is a disparity in the Levels of Significance attributed to the place or elements, the information in the Conservation Plan (2010) takes precedence as the most comprehensive assessment of the values of the place and the primary guiding document. Any discrepancies are discussed in more detail as part of the assessment.

Statement of Significance:

The Conservation Plan for *Norman House and Cheyne's Stables & Outbuilding* provides the following Statement of Significance for the place:

Norman House and Cheyne's Stables & Outbuilding, a two storey rendered painted granite and brick building with a corrugated iron roof in the Victorian Georgian style completed in c1858, and a single-storey brick outbuilding with a corrugated iron roof in the Vernacular style build in the mid-to-late 1930s has cultural heritage significance for the following reasons:

Norman House is a rare, substantial, well executed and elegant example of a two-storey Victorian Georgian style residence of granite and brick construction, albeit obscured by the present front balcony, and is one of very few two storey residences designed in this style in Western Australia where it is an early example of this style, and *Cheyne's Stables & Outbuilding* is one of the earliest surviving buildings at Albany and a rare surviving example in the region of a 1830s stables and outbuilding;

The place evidences the lifestyle of one of Albany's earliest and most successful European settlers, George Cheyne, and the substantial proportions and solid construction of Norman House illustrate the types of houses aspired to by the middle class, of which it is the most

substantial of early examples in Albany, and the solid brick construction of *Cheyne's Stables & Outbuilding* also illustrates Cheyne's ability and aspiration;

The place is a landmark in the residential part of Stirling Terrace;

the place is highly valued by the community for its associations with the early history of Albany especially early settler George Cheyne, and the Hassells, for its uses under Toc H (1930s), as a high school boys' hostel (1946-63), and a guest house since 1964, and for its aesthetic qualities;

the place is associated with George Cheyne, for whom it was built, William Carmalt Clifton, John Hassell and his family, particularly his daughter Ellen Belinda and her husbands Captain Peter Nicholson and Frank Rawling Dymes, Miss Annie Dymes, Toc H, and John Norman in whose honour it was renamed by the Methodist Church; and,

the oak at the place is one of the oldest surviving oak trees in the State.

Significance and Description of Specific Structure:

The following description comes from the Physical Evidence of the Conservation Plan (2010), review of Structural Inspection reports (particularly Peter Baxendale, 2015), archival plans and observations made onsite:

Norman House and *Cheyne's Stables & Outbuilding* are located on Lot 212 (No. 28) Stirling Terrace, Albany. This lot comprises 2329m² and *Norman House* is set back approximately 12m from the front boundary, with the rear portion of the building constructed against the west boundary, and a mature magnolia tree growing in front of the building. *Cheyne's Stables & Outbuilding* is set against the western portion of the rear boundary. A mature oak tree between *Norman House* and *Cheyne's Stables & Outbuilding* is likely to be the same as that shown on one of the first known photographs of Albany, taken by George Chester in the late 1850s or early 1860s. The eastern portion of the Lot is occupied by a contemporary two-storey Student Housing accommodation development constructed on the site in 2018.

Cheyne's Stables & Outbuilding is a single storey rectangular building with face-brick walls and a gabled corrugated iron roof, constructed in the 1830s as an outbuilding, most likely a stable and coach house, for George Cheyne. With its simple detailing and modest proportions, the building is constructed in the vernacular style and includes features that demonstrate its original function including evidence of a now-infilled carriage door, hay loft with high level opening and timber pole for hoisting hay, a wood block floor (to the western room) and split shingle roof covering over split jarrah rafters, tied by jarrah ceiling joists. The external and internal walls are solid brick, with field granite retaining walls below the west and north external walls. The suspended loft floor over the western room has jarrah joists and Oregon flooring. There is plaster & lathe ceilings over the central and eastern rooms, which also have suspended timber floors. There is a shallow cellar area below the eastern room. The front of the building has a series of irregularly placed openings, many containing replacement fenestrations. The building is generally in good condition and has benefited from ongoing repairs particularly since the 1990s. It is currently used for storage.

Norman House is a free-standing two-storey masonry building constructed with both granite and brick walls with an external rendered finish and a hipped corrugated iron roof, designed in the Victorian Georgian style. The building was originally characterized by a symmetrical façade that had pairs of sash windows positioned either side of a central opening. This symmetry is obscured somewhat by the heavy enclosed verandah

structure that was constructed in the 1930s and replaced the original timber-framed balcony. There is a single storey skillion structure to the rear, comprising solid granite walls set partially below natural ground level. This skillion appears to have been extended over time, and an open-air ballroom (later enclosed) constructed over both spaces. The ballroom was converted into a residential apartment in 1962/3.

The present cementitious render to the granite walls was applied over the original ashlar-scored lime render in the 1960s.

The internal layout of *Norman House* largely retains its original symmetry, where a central entrance hall is flanked by two large reception rooms. Beyond the entrance hall is a stair lobby flanked by two smaller rooms. The easternmost room was converted to two bathrooms in the 1980s. At the rear, the former skillion is now a kitchen (to the west) and lounge area (to the east). The kitchen extends into a lightweight timber-framed addition constructed in the Federation-era which also accommodates a dining room and laundry. Upstairs, the first floor layout largely mirrors the ground floor, with two large rooms at the front of the building and a central passage leading out to the enclosed verandah/balcony and a medium-sized room on either side of the stair lobby. The large area (former ballroom) over the rear skillion and addition was converted to a residential apartment in the 1960s.

Internal spaces generally have generous proportions with high ceilings and large rooms. Floors are typically timber boards (135mm wide), there are ornate painted timber skirtings throughout, doors are four-panelled doors with moulded edges. Some of the windows retain early internal shutters and two of the early sash windows are extant on the east wall. The timber stairs are quite narrow and have a return form, with a series of winders at the turn. There are no decorative cornices aside from Room 3 (dates from 1980s), and the ceilings are a mix of plaster and suspended ceilings. All the internal bathroom fit outs are modern.

The Conservation Plan (2010) also identifies the Levels of Significance of specific elements/zones which are summarized as follows:

Zones of Exceptional Significance

- 1858 Structure of Norman House
- Cheyne's Stables & Outbuilding (entire structure)
- Oak Tree

Zones of Considerable Significance

- -

Zones of Some Significance

- Norman House – rear extensions (Federation era)
- Magnolia Tree

Zones of Little Significance

- Steel garage (no longer extant)
- Parking area

Intrusive Zones

- Ground floor verandah and first floor enclosed balcony to front façade
- Introduced bathrooms and ensuites

The following works are proposed to the place. Where aspects of the proposal could detrimentally impact on the heritage significance, the reasons are explained as well as the measures to be taken to minimize impacts:

The following outlines the proposed works in detail and their impact on the heritage values of the place:

NORMAN HOUSE

It is proposed to demolish the existing *Norman House* to allow for the construction of a new two-storey residential apartment building.

- Condition - The existing *Norman House* is in fair/poor condition and significant structural repairs and remediation is required to stabilize the structure. The structural assessment undertaken in 2015 (see appendices) identified major defects particularly with regards to deteriorated roof structure and roof cover as well as site drainage contributing to rot. Remediation works undertaken in 2018 helped address the site drainage issues, but no repair was undertaken to the moisture-damaged fabric or the roof. Over time, these elements have continued to deteriorate. On the basis of the nature and extent of the existing structural defects and the intrusive and expensive works required to address these works, it is not considered financially feasible to undertake the full extent of required repairs to retain the building.
- Integrity/Use - The existing *Norman House* has been vacant since 2015 due to structural and compliance issues identified by independent consultants that deemed the place unsuitable for continued use. The integrity of the place is diminished by its lack of compatible use, noting it has always had a residential function and the proposed demolition and replacement will allow reinstatement of a residential function to the location, albeit not within the original structure.
- Authenticity –*Norman House* has moderate authenticity. A number of major elements have been altered including the front verandah, the roof, some of the fenestration, the fabric of the rear verandah and the render to external walls. The internal layout and fabric has been modified and bathrooms and ensuites have been introduced into significant rooms. The proposed demolition of *Norman House* will greatly reduce the authenticity of the place, noting that there may be ways to salvage material for re-use on the site (Particularly the stone and brick from the walls, and potentially the timber framing from internal elements)
- Building Compliance - The existing *Norman House* has inherent construction compliance issues as confirmed by an independent building surveyor (SBCWA 2015), primarily related to legacy issues that would need to be addressed before safe occupancy could be re-instated. The last use of the place was as a Bed & Breakfast (Class 3) but without fire separated sole occupancy units, universal access provision to at least one SOU and rectification of the fire resistance issues inherent in its current construction type and proximity to the boundary, that will be difficult to achieve. The building could only be occupied as a single residential building (Class 1a) in its current state, which is not considered feasible for an 8-bedroom x 6 bathroom building.
- Aesthetic Values - The external expression of *Norman House* was first substantially modified in the 1930s when the place was gifted to the Toc H (a Christian Service organization) and re-named 'Edward House'. During this phase the original elegant verandah/balcony that characterized the residence was removed and replaced with a heavy pier structure that was enclosed on the upper floor, original windows were removed on the west side of the front façade and the roof form was altered to accommodate a chapel. These changes obscured the original design features and proportions of the place, and over time the simple Georgian expression has been lost to ongoing unsympathetic renovations and alterations. It is debatable as to whether the current building expresses any of the distinct qualities and features of this style, particularly when compared against

archival photos and renderings of the original building. In particular, the proportions and symmetry of the building are at odds with those usually associated with the style. The demolition of the building will have a negative impact on the aesthetic values of Norman House, noting that these are already significantly compromised by previous interventions into the fabric.

- Landmark values – Norman House is identified as being a landmark in the residential part of Stirling Terrace by virtue of its elevated setting and commanding presence. These landmark qualities are proposed to be interpreted in the replacement building, which matches the scale, form and presence of Norman House, as well as occupying the same building footprint. It is therefore noted that this heritage value is able to be interpreted, although the unique detail of the existing building form will no longer be evident.
- Rarity – *Norman House* is noted in the Statement of Significance as being rare as a surviving example of 1850s two-storey granite and brick Victorian Georgian style residence, “and is one of very few two storey residences designed in this style in Western Australia where it is an early example of this style”. There are other similar places in Albany, including the 1845 Government Resident’s House (also known as *Kooka’s*) which is on the State Register and is noted as “a good example of a two-storey rendered house in the Victorian Georgian style, of which only a small number remain in the Albany area”. The Register documentation for *Kooka’s* seems to suggest that *Kooka’s* is the oldest two-storey building from the original settlement on the shore of Princess Royal Harbour and is the only surviving building from the early Victorian Georgian streetscape of Stirling Terrace. Whilst the Register documentation acknowledges that there are design similarities between *Kooka’s* and *Norman House*, it does not appear consider them to be of comparable heritage value, and also notes other local two-storey residences from the era such as the farmhouse at Old Farm Strawberry Hill (1836) and Old Surrey in Burt Street (1841). It is therefore unclear whether the rarity of the place is established on the basis of its age, its style or location, all of which are well represented on the State Register throughout Western Australia. There are currently 217 places in Victorian Georgian style on the State Register of Heritage Places and 15 of these are in Albany. If *Norman House* is still considered a rare example of Victorian Georgian style, demolition of the place will have a negative impact on this heritage value.
- Representativeness – *Norman House* is identified as representing its architectural style (Victorian Georgian) and the lifestyle of its first occupant, George Cheyne, being “the types of houses aspired to by the middle class”. The documentary evidence suggests that the building was constructed c.1858 for George Cheyne (then known as Bellevue) with George Cheyne returning to Brighton in 1860 (therefore occupying the place for only 2 years) before it was leased to William Clifton (Agent of the P&O Shipping Line) until 1865 when purchased by John Hassell. It would appear that the scale and amenity of the building represented the standard of residential accommodation expected by the more wealthy/successful men of Albany at the time of its construction, but subsequent changes to accommodate other uses (hostel, etc) have already obscured the expression of the place as a single residence. The representative value of the place will be further negatively impacted by the demolition of *Norman House*, although with no public access to the building, the ability for the broader community to appreciate this value is already limited to views of the street façade only.
- Historic value – *Norman House* has identified historic value for its association with the early history of Albany and its association with significant people who once lived in the place. This value is already interpreted at the place through plaques recognizing these historic links and it is feasible that this value could be better expressed with more engaging interpretation devices. The current naming of the place in particular does not necessarily relate to its earliest or most significant associations, but the Cr. John Norman who converted the place from its original residential function to the boys hostel in 1946.

- Social Value – *Norman House* has identified social value to the local community for its historic associations and aesthetic values as expressed by its inclusion on the Local Heritage Survey. These values can feasibly be retained as there are other former historic sites on the local Survey.

It is proposed to replace *Norman House* with a new two-storey residential building which is intended to align generally with the footprint of the existing building and is designed to interpret the design features of Victorian Georgian architectural style in a contemporary building.

- The replacement building is of similar scale, proportion and expression to *Norman House*, albeit with a partial undercroft storey to accommodate vehicle parking and amenity/Service areas underneath. When viewed from the street, the new building will generally present as two-storey rendered masonry building with a two-storey verandah/balcony structure that reflects the simple elegance of the original 'Bellevue' residence (c1858). The hipped roof is proposed to match the steeper pitch of the original building (before the roof was modified in the 1930s, with a lower pitched skillion verandah roof supported on posts with simple vertical balusters to the handrail. Fenestrations have been arranged symmetrically to reference this characteristic of the Georgian Style, maintaining a vertical proportion. The design of the replacement building is considered to be a sympathetic re-interpretation of the original features and architectural expression of *Norman House*.

CHEYNE'S STABLES & OUTBUILDING

It is proposed to retain *Cheyne's Stables & Outbuilding* and adapt the building for re-use as a communal activity room for residents of the site. The building has been vacant for many decades and is currently used for storage.

- Condition – *Cheyne's Stables & Outbuilding* are currently in fair/good condition, with previous major issues caused by damp having been addressed by the landowner through stormwater management and external landscaping works. Likewise the internal fabric of the building has been stabilized through conservation works undertaken over the last decade. The proposed adaptive re-use will have a positive impact on the condition of *Cheyne's Stables & Outbuilding* and will improve the physical presentation and ongoing maintenance of the building.
- Authenticity - *Cheyne's Stables & Outbuilding* has a high degree of authenticity. Elements that have been altered include the addition of corrugated iron sheeting over the shingle roof cladding, the removal of both internal walls and the replacement of the western wall using brick salvaged from the demolished hostel toilet, the loss of ceilings in two of the rooms and the infill of the wide coach opening. The proposed adaptive re-use will not involve removal of any authentic fabric from the place, although some floor coverings may be required to be overlaid onto the existing timber block floor to protect it and facilitate habitation.
- Integrity – *Cheyne's Stables & Outbuilding* is believed to have been originally designed as an outbuilding for stabling horses and storage of the carriage and tack, as well as being for general storage etc. There is some conjecture as to whether the building was ever occupied as a 'cottage', and some of the internal finishes are no longer 'agricultural' as would be expected for an outbuilding such as plaster & lathe ceilings, cornices and jarrah floorboards. The proposed new use is considered compatible with Policy 51 from the Conservation Plan as it does not require significant interventions to the existing fabric, and new services to be introduced will include lighting, power and water, which can be installed sensitively.
- Building Compliance - *Cheyne's Stables & Outbuilding* would currently be classified as Class 10a non-habitable structure and some compliance works would be required to improve the accessibility of the space if it is to be converted to a Class 9b Public Building. These works should be able to be accommodated without major changes to the fabric as the building already has large width openings.
- Aesthetic values – *Cheyne's Stables & Outbuilding* has aesthetic value as a representative example of a vernacular building from the 1830s. The building is recognized for its rustic charm and this

character will be retained as part of the adaptive re-use, with minor interior upgrades of finishes proposed only, including protective coverings to the significant flooring (which is uneven and needs minor repair), repainting of timber-joinery and wall finishes, repair to the hayloft ceiling, repair and repainting of fenestrations, as well as re-connection of services (electrical and hydraulic). These proposed changes will improve the condition and presentation of *Cheyne's Stables & Outbuilding* and allow reactivation of the vacant building.

- Historic values – *Cheyne's Stables & Outbuilding* is noted as having historic value for its association with George Cheyne and his early enterprises in Albany, expressed through its solid brick construction, that purports to 'illustrate Cheyne's ability and aspiration'. These values will be retained.

The oak at the place is also recognized as having historic value as "one of the oldest surviving oak trees in the State". The tree is proposed to be retained and protected as part of the works and therefore there will be no negative impacts on the historic value of the tree.

Conservation Plan Policies

The Conservation Plan (Lynne Farrow Architect and Robin Chinnery, Historian, 2010) is considered the primary guiding document for *Norman House* and *Cheyne's Stables & Outbuilding* and provides a good overview of the key issues affecting the place, as well as the key policy outcomes desirable for the place.

Key Policy statements that affect this proposal are as follows:

- *Policy 4 – Places of cultural significance should be conserved* (Burra Charter Article 2.1)
- *Policy 11 – The fabric of areas of exceptional significance should be preserved, restored or reconstructed as appropriate.* (Note: The 'exceptional' level of significance attributed to the place is not supported by the current heritage listings of the place, which has already been deemed not to meet the threshold for inclusion on the State Register, as would be expected for any place with 'exceptional' heritage significance).
- *Policies 18-21 – Authentic fabric in the Zones of Exceptional Significance should not be altered unless to reverse previous alterations.*
- *Policy 23 – Services should be provided to the buildings with as little damage to the original fabric of the building as possible. Introduced elements should have minimal visual intrusion. Fittings should be appropriate to the cultural heritage significance of the place.*

There are no explicit policies that prevent demolition, although it is inferred that this is not considered a "conservation" action and is therefore undesirable.

Conclusion:

NORMAN HOUSE

Demolition of *Norman House* will have significant negative impacts on the authenticity of the place, as well as some impacts on its historic, social and aesthetic values. There is some possibility of interpreting these values through the preparation of an archival record, the implementation of a Heritage Interpretation Strategy and the design of the replacement building, but it is acknowledged that the heritage fabric of a place is the best representation of its heritage values.

The aesthetic values of *Norman House* have been irreversibly altered over time, especially with the renovations and alterations undertaken from the 1930s through to the 1980s which saw the loss of the original verandah structure, changes to the symmetry of the front façade, rendering of the original masonry

walls with a thick cementitious render, alterations to the roof form, additions to the side and rear which changed the external form and scale of the building as well as substantial internal modifications to accommodate a variety of uses. It is debatable whether its current expression demonstrates the typical elegance and modesty of its Victorian Georgian style, or whether it would be viable to retrieve these qualities without major alterations and/or demolition of portions of the existing building.

If demolition is considered acceptable for the economic, social and environmental factors outlined by the proponent, it is recommended that the following approach is considered to mitigate negative heritage impacts:

- Preparation of an Archival Record of Norman House
- Preparation and Implementation of a Heritage Interpretation Strategy for Norman House
- Consideration for salvage and re-use of early/original building fabric, particularly stone and masonry and hardwood timber.
- Sensitive interpretation of original Victorian Georgian design in features and expression of replacement building

CHEYNE'S STABLE & OUTBUILDING

The adaptive re-use of *Cheyne's Stable & Outbuilding* will include conservation works as well as new building works to allow the building to be used as a habitable space. The proposed modifications are considered to support the compatible use of the place and are in accordance with Burra Charter principles as well as the policies of the Conservation Plan (2010).

References:

- Conservation Plan for Norman House and Cheynes's Stables & Outbuilding*, prepared by Lynne Farrow Architect, and Robin Chinnery Historian on behalf of the Uniting Church, Albany, dated May 2010 (Funded by Lotterywest, 2009).
- Norman House & Cheyne's Cottage Building Condition Assessment Report - Structural Services*, prepared by Peter Baxendale Consulting Engineer on behalf of the Great Southern Community Housing Association, 14 July 2015
- Norman House – Lot 212 Stirling Terrace Albany. BCA Assessment of existing Local Heritage Listed Two Storey Building for use as Student Accommodation (Class 3)*, by Statewide Building Certification WA, dated 8 June 2016.
- Norman House & Magnolia Tree Place Record Form*, City of Albany Survey of Heritage Places, supplied by City of Albany, dated 2020
- Cheyne's Stable, Outbuilding & Oak Tree Place Record Form*, City of Albany Survey of Heritage Places, supplied by City of Albany, dated 2020
- Register Entry and Assessment Documentation for P15554 *Kooka's/Government Resident's House & Commissariat Office*, 210 Stirling Terrace, dated 20/05/2003.
- Archival plans of Norman House as published in Conservation Plan
- Archival photographs and illustrations as published in *Old Albany, photographs 1850-1950*, by John Dowson, published by ACCI 2008.